

PRESS RELEASE

Monday, December 7th, 2009

Key Pipped At The Post In Trans Tasman's Roll Call

Trans Tasman's 2009 Roll Call has elevated Speaker of the House, Lockwood Smith to top of its rankings this year.

Each year Trans Tasman's Editors rank all MPs on the basis of their performance in Caucus, Cabinet, Committee, the House and Electorate and the influence they bring to bear in their various forums.

This year on 9.25 out of 10 Lockwood Smith is top of the pile.

Smith gets the nod because of his stellar performance as Speaker. He has been a revelation. A journeyman politician for most of his time in the House, Smith has finally found his niche. His score more than doubles from 4.5 last year to 9.25.

Trans Tasman says "his insistence Ministers answer questions properly swept away decades of ducking and dodging allowed by his predecessors. Runs the House fairly, rarely raises his voice and is a student of standing orders and speakers' rulings." He has had regular contact with the media and introduced a new route for the procession so the public could see it.

He created "an overdue infusion of good sense and a real commitment to Parliament." Trans Tasman says Smith is probably the best Speaker since National's Matthew Oram in 1950-57.

Trans Tasman says of John Key, who rates 9 out of 10 – "He has been called a political phenomenon, a truly remarkable PM who has proved effective leadership doesn't depend on decades of Parliamentary experience. Works on advice and instinct, probably more of the latter, with an easy confident manner which tends to hide strong resolve."

But except for the ETS there have been no really meaty decisions. Key's vast potential is noted, but the jury is still out on his ability to deliver. And Trans Tasman questions whether both Key and his deputy Bill English have the courage to make hard decisions. English drops from 8.5 last year to 8.

At the other end of the scale is Parliament's current villain Hone Harawira. Trans Tasman comments – "There are no excuses. His appalling behaviour was a disgrace. An MP with no respect for Parliament and doesn't deserve to be there." Harawira rates Zero for his efforts in 2009.

He just pips Labour's perennial low scorer Ashraf Choudray who moved his score up from 0.5 last year to 1, and National's Colin King who scores 2 and "may not have noticed National is in power."

The Labour opposition scores poorly this year, mainly a reflection of the party's disarray after its heavy election defeat. Of leader Phil Goff, Trans Tasman says he "hasn't under-performed. If he's perceived to have under-achieved its because the country is coming out of a recession and everyone likes John Key."

"Labour's caucus functions well, the party held a successful annual conference and apart from early speed wobbles Goff has made the most of his limited opportunities. The first year in opposition is always hard." He falls from a creditable 7 as Trade Minister to 5.5 as Opposition leader.

Ironically Labour's backbenchers have done better in opposition than they did in Government, as many of them now actually have something to do, and seem happy about it.

Pick of the other top National Party Ministers is Simon Power who goes from 8 last year to 8.5 this year – "A multi-skilled Minister with the ability to handle impressive workloads, Power can also cross the divide between parties and has earned respect from the opposition."

Continued Over...

Gerry Brownlee is another star performer moving from 7.5 in 2008 to 8 this year. "Can excel in his best moments and blunder through the worst of them but his enthusiasm for driving development and realising mineral resource potential has helped his reputation."

Health Minister Tony Ryall also goes up, from 7 to 8, but "next year is going to be harder than this one when health funding increases are cut."

Other top stars are the Maori Party pair of Pita Sharples – "still the mana man despite sometimes losing the plot. Strong bond with John Key overcame problems which could have derailed the support agreement. Essential presence for the future of the party." He gets 7.

Tariana Turia is another top performer – "careful and cautious attitude probably doesn't impress activists but she's got a firm grip on the realities of politics and how to make deals for Maori." She also scores 7 out of 10.

For the record, National managed to get 20 of its 58 MPs above the 5 mark, while Labour managed just 6 of its 43 above the 5 level.

The Greens had just 1 of 9 above 5, while the Maori Party was held back by Hone Harawira – the others were all over the 5 mark.

For National 23 of its MPs boosted their score, 9 went down and 10 stayed the same. The 16 newcomers couldn't be compared on last year's result. 10 Labour MPs boosted their scores, while 16 fell and 2 stayed the same. Not one of Labour's front bench managed to improve on last year's score.

There were 15 Labour newcomers unable to be compared with last year. No Green MP managed to lift their score, while ACT had 1 up and 1 down with the 3 newcomers not compared with 2008's result.

ENDS

For more details: Max Bowden (Publisher/Editor In Chief) or Tony Doe (Research Analyst) 03 365 3891 <www.transtasman.co.nz>.

Published since 1968, The Trans Tasman Political Letter is a weekly analytical commentary on what's happening in NZ politics, the economy, legislation and trade. Max Bowden is Editor in Chief and Ian Templeton is Senior Writer. It's read and subscribed to by Cabinet Ministers, Government Departments (both NZ and Aust), Embassies, SOEs, Lobbyists, Accounting and Law Professionals, Directors of Public Companies and Overseas Media including The Economist, BBC, Wall Street Journal and Financial Times. Trans Tasman's Roll Call is in its 7th year. The 6 major contributors (all parliamentary insiders) to Trans Tasman each independently provide their views and opinions on each politician's performance in Caucus, Cabinet, Select Committees, the House and Electorate. The ratings are then debated by the 6 and a final verdict arrived at.

ROLL CALL – How Our MPs Performed In 2009

Trans Tasman's Editors have once again run their rule over NZ's MPs and rated their performance in 2009. Roll Call looks at how they've performed in Caucus, Cabinet, Committee, the House and Electorate and the influence they bring to bear in their various forums. This year you will notice the Cabinet members, Ministers outside Cabinet and the Opposition front bench have been given more prominence so you can see how the real power brokers have performed. This issue of Roll Call also marks the end of the Key Govt's first year, and some new MPs are scored for the first time.

Cabinet Ministers					
Name	Seat/list	Responsibilities	Comments	2008 Rating	This Year's Rating
<i>Key, John</i>	Helensville	Prime Minister, Minister of Tourism, Ministerial Services, Minister in Charge of the NZ Security, Intelligence Service, Minister Responsible for the GCSB	Key has been called a political phenomenon, a truly remarkable PM who has proved effective leadership doesn't depend on decades of Parliamentary experience. Works on advice and instinct, probably more of the latter, with an easy confident manner which tends to hide strong resolve. Runs cabinet with a loose rein which sometimes allows problems to develop. Except for the ETS he has made no meaty decisions. His vast potential is noted but the jury is still out on his ability to deliver.	9	9
<i>English, Bill</i>	Clutha-Southland	Deputy Prime Minister Minister of Finance Minister for Infrastructure	Tested by his first budget delivered under dire circumstances, English carefully balanced spending cuts against social policy and avoided a ratings downgrade. He's run a tight fiscal ship, sometimes considered too extreme with his warnings of how hard the next few years are going to be. He lost some ground in calling for fiscal discipline despite his own problem with the housing allowance. Didn't lose his cool.	8.5	8
<i>Brownlee, Gerry</i>	Ilam	Minister for Economic Development Minister of Energy and Resources Leader of the House Associate Minister for the Rugby World Cup	A mixture of cocky confidence and what can appear to be cautious uncertainty, Brownlee improved through the year and at the end of it had a better grip on his portfolios. Can excel in his best moments and blunder through the worst of them but his enthusiasm for driving development and realising mineral resource potential has helped his reputation. And as Leader of the House - Parliament was running a lot better at the end of the year than it was at the beginning.	7.5	8
<i>Power, Simon</i>	Rangitikei	Minister of Justice Minister for State Owned Enterprises Minister of Commerce Minister Responsible for the Law Commission Associate Minister of Finance Deputy Leader of the House	If something catastrophic happened to John Key, Power would be the most likely candidate for the leadership. A multi-skilled Minister with the ability to handle impressive workloads, Power can also cross the divide between parties and has earned respect from the opposition. Strong performance in the House without resorting to rhetoric, handled more Bills than any other Minister and has the best media management in the Beehive.	8	8.5
<i>Ryall, Tony</i>	Bay of Plenty	Minister of Health Minister of State Services	Ryall used three years as opposition health spokesman to build sector networks which are paying off. A senior Minister in the previous National Govt, he's a smooth and experienced operator who handles a difficult portfolio with apparent ease. Won applause for the way he handled the swine flu crisis but next year is going to be harder than this one when health funding increases are cut.	7	8
<i>Smith, Nick</i>	Nelson	Minister for the Environment Minister for Climate Change Issues Minister for ACC	High quality Minister handling the Govt's most difficult bills - and understanding them. Smith plays high risk politics and there's a feeling his issues are only just under control. Exaggerating ACC figures, which were bad enough anyway, did him no good, and Labour is still chasing him hard on it. They're waiting for him to make a big mistake, so far he hasn't.	6.5	7.5

Name	Seat/list	Responsibilities	Comments	2008 Rating	This Year's Rating
<i>Collins, Judith</i>	Papakura	Minister of Police Minister of Corrections Minister of Veterans' Affairs	Loves her job, and her 'crusher' nickname. Ran into early Corrections Department problems which she handled well, a quick learner passionate about her portfolios. Her cabinet colleagues enjoy seeing her deal out damage to opposition MPs in the House. A good year introducing some strong new laws, whether they work will prove her real worth	7.5	7
<i>Tolley, Anne</i>	East Coast	Minister of Education Minister for Tertiary Education Minister Responsible for the Education Review Office	Doesn't display the same natural abilities as her senior cabinet colleagues. Tolley was stuck with some difficult education policies which she drove through with obstinate determination and, at first, inadequate understanding of their impact. The introduction of national standards has to work for her to survive. Seen as "lacking" by Labour (and some of her colleagues).	7.5	6
<i>Finlayson, Chris</i>	List	Attorney-General [Includes responsibility for Serious Fraud Office] Minister for Treaty of Waitangi Negotiations Minister for Arts, Culture and Heritage	Seriously sincere most of the time with odd forays of chirpy insolence in the House. Finlayson is highly rated by both sides and, like Simon Power, can work across boundaries. He's going to need all of his abilities to complete the toughest task of all - a replacement for the Foreshore and Seabed Act which has broad support in Parliament. We have a feeling he's going to do it.	7	7
<i>Carter, David</i>	List	Minister of Agriculture Minister for Bio-Security Minister of Forestry	Competent if unspectacular performance with agriculture. He has a good grip of the basics and doesn't court controversy. Farmers might have expected more. He could suffer from hostility towards the ETS which isn't his problem.	5	6
<i>McCully, Murray</i>	East Coast Bays	Minister of Foreign Affairs Minister for Sport and Recreation Minister for the Rugby World Cup	He has been the surprise in the Key Cabinet, doing the spadework in shaping foreign policy and getting a better hearing in Washington than in the days of Labour. Will appointing an outsider to head MFAT come back to haunt him?	7	7
<i>Groser, Tim</i>	List	Minister of Trade Minister of Conservation Associate Minister of Foreign Affairs Associate Minister for Climate Change Issues (International Negotiations)	Previously a top international trade negotiator, Groser is the right man for the job. Confident and, some say, arrogant about his own abilities but he's invaluable as the Govt pushes an export-led recovery. Doesn't seek publicity and doesn't need to.	7.5	7
<i>Mapp, Wayne</i>	North Shore	Minister of Defence Minister of Research, Science and Technology Associate Minister for Economic Development Associate Minister for Tertiary Education	There were doubts about his ability but Mapp has handled defence well enough. Better media presence than he was in opposition, appears to have a genuine commitment to science and technology portfolio.	5	5.5
<i>Joyce, Steven</i>	List	Minister of Transport Minister for Communications and Information Technology Associate Minister of Finance Associate Minister for Infrastructure	Made a Minister a few weeks after becoming an MP and quickly gained a 'safe pair of hands' reputation. Careful to assess public opinion before making decisions and said to be a voice of reason in Cabinet. Close to John Key and mentioned as a successor to Bill English if the finance portfolio changes hands.	N/A	7.5
<i>te Heuheu, Georgina</i>	List	Minister for Courts Minister of Pacific Island Affairs Minister for Disarmament and Arms Control Associate Minister of Maori Affairs	A quiet, unassuming year with little visibility. Essential link between Maori Party Ministers and the Cabinet, which is under the radar	6.5	5
<i>Bennett, Paula</i>	Waitakere	Minister of Youth Affairs Minister for Social Development & Employment	Labour thought she was going to fall over and put Annette King into the shadow portfolio to trip her up. Against expectations, she's firmly on her feet and proving to be a popular Minister. Steep learning curve for a folksy MP who likes her 'westie' image. Good year and she'll improve with keeping	7	6.5
<i>Heatley, Phil</i>	Whangarei	Minister of Fisheries Minister of Housing	Had a lot more to say for himself in opposition than he does in Govt. Pushed through changes to the Residential Tenancies Act.	6.5	6.5

Name	Seat/list	Responsibilities	Comments	2008 Rating	This Year's Rating
<i>Wong, Pansy</i>	Botany	Minister for Ethnic Affairs Minister of Women's Affairs Associate Minister for ACC Associate Minister of Energy & Resources	An Asian institution in Parliament and a party networker outside of it. Probably at the limits of her ability but she can be a lively speaker and a determined advocate for Govt policies	4	5
<i>Coleman, Jonathan</i>	Northcote	Minister of Immigration Minister of Broadcasting Associate Minister of Tourism Associate Minister of Health	A good start when he handled some tricky immigration issues, ruined by the World Cup TV coverage fiasco. Like others, he was ignorant of events within a dysfunctional set of Ministers. But broadcasting is his portfolio, he should have been on top of it. Has potential	6	5
<i>Wilkinson, Kate</i>	List	Minister of Labour Minister for Food Safety Associate Minister of Immigration Associate Minister for Conservation	Wobbly start when she wasn't in the decision-making loop may have dented her confidence. Improved as the year went on although she needs to be more assertive. Made a mess of the folate in bread issue.	6	4.5
Ministers Outside Cabinet					
<i>Williamson, Maurice</i>	Pakuranga	Minister Outside Cabinet for Building & Construction Minister of Customs Minister of Statistics Minister for Small Business Minister for Land Information	Inherited leaky homes, which gave Labour Ministers migraines. If he's making progress he isn't saying much about it. Seems to have an aversion to the media, which may be a hangover from previous highly-publicised indiscretions. It would be risky to under-estimate him.	3	5
<i>Carter, John</i>	Northland	Minister Outside Cabinet Minister of Civil Defence Minister for Senior Citizens Minister for Racing Associate Minister of Local Government	Promotion unlikely after the tsunami civil defence debacle. Attempts to defend it weren't credible - he had a year to fix issues he spent a lot of time criticising when he was in opposition. Weak efforts to help the racing industry.	2.5	3
<i>Guy, Nathan</i>	Otaki	Minister of Internal Affairs Minister Responsible for Archives New Zealand Minister Responsible for National Library Associate Minister of Justice Associate Minister of Transport	Young and capable, portfolios offer him a chance to learn. Could reach mid-cabinet ranks if he handles them well.	4.5	5
<i>Hide, Rodney</i>	Epsom	Minister of Local Government Minister For Regulatory Reform Associate Minister of Commerce	ACT's leader crashed from his pedestal after a bad bout of perk troughing, then seriously damaged himself with inane comments about John Key. Abject apology followed. Prodigious effort as local government minister guiding Auckland through its transition but discovered his limits when he tried to reform local government.	5.5	4
<i>Roy, Heather</i>	List	Minister of Consumer Affairs Associate Minister of Defence Associate Minister of Education	Diligent if unexceptional junior minister. Disappointing because she promised more and was lively in opposition. Low profile portfolios don't help.	5	5
<i>Sharples, Pita</i>	Tamaki Makarau	Minister of Maori Affairs Associate Minister of Corrections Associate Minister of Education	Still the mana man despite sometimes losing the plot. Strong bond with John Key overcame problems which could have derailed the support agreement. Essential presence for the future of the party.	7	7
<i>Turia, Tariana</i>	Te Tai Hauauro	Minister for the Community and Voluntary Sector Associate Minister of Health Associate Minister for Social Development and Employment	Proved her value again this year. Careful and cautious attitude probably doesn't impress activists but she's got a firm grip on the realities of politics and how to make deals for Maori.	7.5	7
United Future					
<i>Dunne, Peter</i>	Ohariu	Minister of Revenue Associate Minister of Health	No one doubts his competence as a minister, but his party is sliding into obscurity. Whether he cares remains to be seen, but he might not find it easy to hang on to his electorate next time.	4.5	4
National Back Benchers					
<i>Adams, Amy</i>	Selwyn		Thoughtful with an eye for detail. New MP has made a good start with a worthwhile member's Bill in her name.	N/A	5

Name	Seat/list	Responsibilities	Comments	2008 Rating	This Year's Rating
<i>Ardern, Shane</i>	Taranaki-King Country		Difficult to notice in government, as he was in opposition. But promotion to chair Primary Products Select Committee was warranted and he's said to be making a fist of it.	2.5	3.5
<i>Auchinvole, Chris</i>	West Coast-Tasman		His name, as he has pointed out, is pronounced ock-in-vole. Hasn't pointed out much else.	3	3
<i>Bakshi, Kanwaljit</i>	List		Immigration allegations may have spooked him and heart surgery put him out of action. Sensible speaker needs to show some confidence.	N/A	4
<i>Bennett, David</i>	Hamilton East		Competent MP needs to show a bit more energy in the House. Gets bullied on Committees.	2.5	2.5
<i>Blue, Jackie</i>	List		Subdued this year after missing out on an associate health promotion because there wasn't room for her.	5	4.5
<i>Borrows, Chester</i>	Whanganui		Former police officer is always worth listening to. Pity he's still on the backbench, gets a point for taking the Wanganui gang patch ban bill through Parliament.	5	6
<i>Bridges, Simon</i>	Tauranga		Clever MP isn't meeting expectations. Is he bored? Needs to be tested.	N/A	4
<i>Calder, Cam</i>	List		Richard Worth's replacement shows early promise as a vigorous debater. Too early to say whether he's going to be any good at anything else	N/A	4
<i>Dean, Jacqui</i>	Waitaki		Had a seamless transition from opposition to Govt. Should be making more of it.	3	3
<i>Foss, Craig</i>	Tukituki		On the edge of cabinet. Solid grafter likely to work his way through to promotion.	5	5.5
<i>Gilmore, Aaron</i>	List		Has lacked exposure, maybe he should push himself harder but there are few opportunities.	N/A	4
<i>Goodhew, Jo</i>	Rangitata		Hard worker, another who needs to raise her profile unless she's satisfied with not being noticed. Valuable committee member.	4	4.5
<i>Goudie, Sandra</i>	Coromandel		More lively in opposition than in Govt. Getting chair of Law and Order Select Committee gives seasoned MP a reason to be there.	4.5	4
<i>Hayes, John</i>	Wairarapa		Erratic bursts of energy from this oddly controversial MP. Still seems dissatisfied with life in Parliament.	2.5	3
<i>Henare, Tau</i>	List		Often exhibits more bull than brains but he livens up an otherwise dull backbench, no one is going to die wondering what he thinks. Chair of Maori Affairs Select Committee, which isn't easy.	2.5	3.5
<i>Hutchison, Paul</i>	Hunua		More health sector experience than anyone else in Parliament. He's a gentleman and a scholar, lack of political savagery keeps him off the front bench. Chair of Health Select Committee, he initiated the inquiry into prostate cancer.	4.5	5.5
<i>Kaye, Nikki</i>	Auckland Central		One of the brighter first termers, ready to mix it with the opposition. Taking Auckland Central from Labour was huge, gives her confidence and credibility, but she may push it too far.	N/A	4.5
<i>King, Colin</i>	Kaikoura		May not have noticed National is in power.	2	2
<i>Lee, Melissa</i>	List		Dreadful Mt Albert campaign but she was let down by the party. She's learned the hard way and she's better than she's often perceived to be. Sure to improve.	N/A	4
<i>Sam Lotu-Liga, Peseta</i>	Maungakiekie		If he's as brilliant as people said he was when he was elected, now would be a good time to show it. Sensible speaker but nothing exceptional so far.	N/A	4

Name	Seat/list	Responsibilities	Comments	2008 Rating	This Year's Rating
<i>Macindoe, Tim</i>	Hamilton West		Comes into the Aaron Gilmore category, a new MP doing what is required in his first year but he's difficult to notice.	N/A	4
<i>McClay, Todd</i>	Rotorua		Lively debater with a good presence in the House. Clever speaker with a sense of humour.	N/A	4.5
<i>Parata, Hekia</i>	List		Sensible Maori MP, so far unexceptional but she could rise in the ranks.	N/A	4
<i>Peachey, Allan</i>	Tamaki		A much improved year, being in Govt suits him. Strong advocate of Govt's education policies, chair of education and science select committee.	3.5	5
<i>Quinn, Paul</i>	List		Thinks he's one of the guns. He isn't. Aggressive preening doesn't impress anyone.	N/A	2
<i>Roy, Eric</i>	Invercargill		Veteran MP is still good value. Doesn't push himself to the front and doesn't have to. Careful, worthwhile speaker respected by opposition.	3.5	4.5
<i>Shanks, Katrina</i>	List		Really needs to start being noticed. Diligent but doesn't show much enthusiasm.	3.5	3.5
<i>Smith, Lockwood</i>	Rodney	Speaker	Found his niche as Speaker. His insistence Ministers answer questions properly swept away decades of ducking and dodging allowed by his predecessors. Runs the House fairly, rarely raises his voice and is a student of standing orders and speakers' rulings. An overdue infusion of good sense and a real commitment to Parliament.	4.5	9.25
<i>Tisch, Lindsay</i>	Waikato	Deputy Speaker	Excellent deputy speaker controls the House well. Respected by members and he know what he's doing in the chair.	4.5	5
<i>Tremain, Chris</i>	Napier	Junior Whip	Promoted to senior whip. It's a tough job he appears to be managing well.	5.5	5.5
<i>Upston, Louise</i>	Taupo		No sparks yet, a first term MP who, like others, is on a learning curve. Sincere and ordinary.	N/A	4
<i>Wagner, Nicky</i>	List		Well on the way to becoming a permanent fixture on the back bench, if she isn't already.	2	3
<i>Woodhouse, Michael</i>	List		Has the sense to mostly breathe through his nose while he finds his way around. Nothing marks him out so far.	N/A	4
<i>Young, Jonathan</i>	New Plymouth		Like the other newbies, he hasn't had many opportunities to shine. Hasn't made any either.	N/A	4
ACT					
<i>Boscawen, John</i>	List		Highly-charged MP is a powerful speaker but he's wasting much of it on an obsession with the smacking ban, which he detests. Has to remove blinkers, move on, and make a difference on live issues. Could become a real asset for the party.	N/A	4.5
<i>Douglas, Roger</i>	List		Time warping MP hasn't changed - the Government is wasting billions, taxes are way too high, everyone else is wrong and he could fix everything. Has maintained absolute self-belief since the 1980s. Often seems to make sense, which is a worry.	N/A	5
<i>Garrett, David</i>	List		Serious cases of foot-in-mouth damaged this hard-liner's year. Tireless advocate for tougher sentencing and his 'three strikes' legislation. Good value despite uncouth utterances.	N/A	4
Maori					
<i>Flavell, Te Ururoa</i>	Waiariki		Carried a heavy load in Parliament where his party maintained its record of speaking on every bill. Respected MP avoids useless rhetoric and makes a bigger contribution than is probably apparent.	5	6

Name	Seat/list	Responsibilities	Comments	2008 Rating	This Year's Rating
<i>Harawira, Hone</i>	Te Tai Tokerau		Apology not accepted. There are no excuses. His appalling behaviour was a disgrace. Has no respect for Parliament and shouldn't be there.	4	0
<i>Katene, Rahui</i>	Te Tai Tonga		Showed how effective a first-term MP can be. Shared House duties with Flavell, getting her head around difficult bills and making sense of them. Doesn't lose sight of why she's there.	N/A	6
Labour Front Bench					
<i>Goff, Phil</i>	Mt Roskill	Leader, SIS	Goff hasn't under-performed. If he's perceived to have under-achieved its because the country is coming out of a recession and everyone likes Key. Labour's caucus functions well and apart from early speed wobbles he made the most of his limited opportunities. The first year in opposition is always hard.	7	5.5
<i>King, Annette</i>	Rongotai	Deputy Leader, Social Development	Experienced and capable, King also has an important attribute - she doesn't want to be leader. Valuable mentor of new MPs and a tough debater, King took social development to test Paula Bennett but hasn't yet really rattled the Minister. Good asset for the party.	7	6.5
<i>Cuntiffe, David</i>	New Lynn	Finance	Doesn't come up to Michael Cullen's benchmark but who would? An intelligent finance spokesman who sometimes allows rhetoric to carry him away. Can appear aloof one minute, yet juvenile the next. Hasn't really had policy to work with. Has a political "tin ear."	5	5
<i>Dyson, Ruth</i>	Port Hills	Health	Hasn't really fired as shadow health minister but Tony Ryall is a very difficult target. Needs to strengthen her tactics, lift her profile and drive hard issues. Disappointing. Missing Helen.	6	4
<i>Horomia, Parekura</i>	Ikaroa-Rawhiti	Maori Affairs, Fisheries	Good when he's in action but there's been a lack of it this year. Allows Pita Sharples a free ride most of the time. Doesn't seem to be able to find causes which opposition MPs need for oxygen. Another disappointment.	4.5	3.5
<i>Cosgrove, Clayton</i>	Waimakariri	Law & Order (incl Police & Corrections), SOEs, Associate Finance	Aggressive and hard working but he's in Crusher Collins' demolition zone. Lives to get the better of her and won't stop trying. A good effort against a formidable foe.	5	4.5
<i>Carter, Chris</i>	Te Atatu	Foreign Affairs, Ethnic Affairs	Foreign affairs appointment was unexpected and there are doubts he has the right stuff for the job. Distracted by travel perks excesses and unwise claims he was being targeted because he's gay didn't impress colleagues. Used Samoan tsunami for self promotion. Another person missing Helen's protection.	4	3.5
<i>Mahuta, Nanaia</i>	Hauraki-Waikato	Environment, Tourism, Associate Maori Affairs	Should make a lot more of the environment portfolio, isn't often heard in the House on this critical portfolio. A mediocre year, has to improve her performance.	5.5	4
<i>Street, Maryan</i>	List	Trade, Tertiary Education	Trade was another odd appointment but she works the mainly bi-partisan portfolio well enough in Tim Groser's shadow. Active with tertiary education but it's been a largely forgettable year. No longer has Helen's help.	5	3
Labour Back Benchers					
<i>Ardern, Jacinda</i>	List	Youth Affairs, Associate Justice - Youth Justice	Impressive start by a good debater who does her homework. Self-assured young MP, getting noticed and going places.	N/A	4.5
<i>Barker, Rick</i>	List	Courts, Veterans Affairs	Experience doesn't always help. Capped a poor year with the dodgy poll fiasco, competent handling of the House as an associate speaker.	3	2.5
<i>Beaumont, Carol</i>	List	Consumer Affairs, Associate Labour	Good on labour relations, as she should be with her union pedigree. The Government gave her a lot to do and she took it on.	N/A	4

Name	Seat/list	Responsibilities	Comments	2008 Rating	This Year's Rating
<i>Burns, Brendan</i>	Christchurch Central	Broadcasting, Associate Environment - Water Quality	Opportunist trying to make his mark as a protector of charities by hurting gaming and sports. Christchurch MP who won't live there.	N/A	3
<i>Chadwick, Steve</i>	List	Junior Whip, Conservation	Lively junior whip was worth keeping although she lost her Rotorua seat in the clean out.	5	3
<i>Chauvel, Charles</i>	List	Climate Change, Energy, Associate Commerce	An effective, intelligent MP who hit his straps this year and showed what he's capable of. Overlooked for cabinet when Labour was in power, he's showing they were wrong.	4.5	5.5
<i>Chaudhary, Ashraf</i>	List	Food Safety, Agricultural Science, Associate Ethnic Affairs	Colin King's mirror image, he might not have noticed the election result either. If he did, it didn't make any difference. Made a few speeches but must be a prime candidate for rejuvenation. Unless Labour thinks he's got good community links, which some say he has.	0.5	1
<i>Curran, Clare</i>	Dunedin South	Communications & IT	Effective player in the broadband game. Doesn't trash what she thinks is worthwhile.	N/A	4
<i>Dalziel, Lianne</i>	Christchurch East	Justice, Commerce	Chair of Commerce Select Committee should be on the front bench. Cabinet experience shows, excellent analyst of Simon Power's business bills.	6.5	5
<i>Davis, Kelvin</i>	List	Bio-Security, Associate Education	Impressive Maori MP is listened to in the House, has cross-over potential. A good asset.	N/A	4
<i>Fenton, Darien</i>	List	Transport Safety, Associate Labour	A much better year, real commitment to fighting employment law changes.	1	3
<i>Hawkins, George</i>	Manurewa	Housing	He's good when he tries but contributions have been sparse. He's one of Parliament's survivors.	2.5	2
<i>Hipkins, Chris</i>	Rimutaka	Internal Affairs, Associate Energy	A new livewire, full of fight and ideas to make life difficult for the Government. Going up.	N/A	4
<i>Hodgson, Pete</i>	Dunedin North	Immigration, Defence	Demoted to the second bench but he's giving it a good go, helped run the Bill English housing attack. Formidable researcher of bad things.	4	5
<i>Hughes, Darren</i>	List	Senior Whip, Transport	Good on transport and he's the go-to man for caucus issues. Media management skills valuable to Labour - can overdo the good news.	5.5	6
<i>Huo, Raymond</i>	List	Law Commission, Statistics, Associate. Ethnic Affairs	Forgive us for asking Raymond who? Worthy work on commerce issues - seriously tedious.	N/A	3
<i>Jones, Shane</i>	List	Local Government, Building & Construction, Infrastructure	Makes a lot of noise. Harbours leadership ambitions, still has a lot of work to do. He needs to succeed to help change Labour's fortunes.	4	4.5
<i>Laban, Winnie</i>	Mana	Pacific Island Affairs, Associate Health (Aged Care), Associate Economic Development	Still her friendly, graceful self. Naturally reticent, she should be noticed more than she is. Good effort on the Samoan tsunami crisis.	5	5
<i>Lees-Galloway, Iain</i>	Palmerston North	Land Information, Associate Defence, Associate Health - Drugs & Alcohol	Has potential and drafted a member's bill to ban tobacco displays. Needs to gain some momentum though and make himself heard.	N/A	4
<i>Mackey, Moana</i>	List	Rural Affairs, Research & Development, Science & Technology	Opposition seems to suit her. Hard-working MP took it to the Government, much more active.	2.5	4
<i>Mallard, Trevor</i>	Hutt South	Labour, Economic Development, Sports & Recreation	Labour's street fighter revels in combat. Sometimes vicious, always aggressive, he pushed the boundaries and ran into trouble with the Speaker. It's what he's all about.	5	4.5
<i>Moroney, Sue</i>	List	Women's Affairs, Education - ECE	An earnest effort but she has to put more shove into it. This is opposition, MPs must try harder.	2.5	3
<i>Nash, Stuart</i>	List	Revenue, Associate Trade, Associate Forestry	A slow starter who began showing promise in the last few months. Expected to improve.	N/A	4
<i>O'Connor, Damien</i>	List	Associate Agriculture, Bio-Security, Rural Affairs	Seems to enjoy being back but he's been quiet about it. A lightweight in government, he isn't gaining any weight in opposition.	N/A	3
<i>Parker, David</i>	List	Attorney-General, Electoral Reform, ACC, Associate Finance	Another high achiever who put in a huge effort on ACC and forced explanations from the Government. Active on electoral reform as well, an outstanding year.	5	6

Name	Seat/list	Responsibilities	Comments	2008 Rating	This Year's Rating
<i>Pillay, Lynne</i>	List	Disability Issues, Associate Justice - Victims Rights	Raised her profile with good work on domestic violence bills. Retiring at next election.	3	3.5
<i>Prasad, Rajen</i>	List	Voluntary & Community Sector, Associate Ethnic Affairs, Associate Social Development - Family & CYF	Has a lot more to offer than he actually delivers in forgettable speeches. Said to be an effective committee member.	N/A	3
<i>Ririnui, Mita</i>	List	Forestry, Associate Treaty of Waitangi Negotiations, Associate Agriculture	Almost non-existent, must be working behind the scenes. We hope so.	3	2.5
<i>Robertson, Grant</i>	Wellington Central	State Services, Associate Arts, Culture & Heritage, Associate Foreign Affairs	Took it to the Government over state sector cuts and Labour relations. Going up.	N/A	4.5
<i>Robertson, Ross</i>	Manukau East	Small Business, Senior Citizens, Racing, Associate Disarmament & Arms Control	Still pushing his code of conduct for MPs. Didn't push much else this year.	5.5	3.5
<i>Sepuloni, Carmel</i>	List	Civil Defence, Associate Tertiary Education, Associate Social Development	A Labour version of Sam Lotu-Liga Peseta, she was said to have great promise. This isn't yet evidence. Gets the benefit of the doubt for now.	N/A	3
<i>Shearer, David</i>	Mt Albert		Some say he's Labour's John Key but he isn't showing us why. Great C/V. Won an easy seat. High hope for him but very quiet so far.	N/A	3.5
<i>Sio, Su'a William</i>	Mangere	Customs, Associate Pacific Island Affairs, Associate Local Government	Another worthy worker who isn't really delivering the goods. Needs to liven it up.	5	3
<i>Twyford, Phil</i>	List	Disarmament & Arms Control, Auckland Issues, Associate Foreign Affairs - Development Assistance	Standout newcomer, Labour's Auckland issues spokesman was everywhere. All over the super city proposals and doing his own media work. He's charging ahead.	N/A	4.5
Greens					
<i>Bradford, Sue</i>	List		A graceful departure after losing out to Turei for the co-leadership. A divisive figure who pushed her own agenda. Green issues made way as she pursued a social agenda.	3	3
<i>Delahunty, Catherine</i>	List		Left-wing newcomer with impeccable credentials. Flashes of real insight but lacks focus. Needs to identify issues and avoid meandering speeches with no impact.	N/A	3
<i>Fitzsimons, Jeanette</i>	List	Co-Leader	She'll be badly missed when she stands down in 2011. Maintained unwavering commitment, an unchallenged expert on energy conservation the Greens won't be able to replace.	6	6
<i>Graham, Kennedy</i>	List		A brilliant man from an alternative universe. He's too far ahead of his time for Parliament to notice his solutions for planetary problems.	N/A	3
<i>Hague, Kevin</i>	List		Morose member needs to lighten up and try to be interesting. Greens need to be visionaries.	N/A	3
<i>Kedgley, Sue</i>	List		Makes up for the lack of energy among some of her colleagues. Trench warfare exponent who won't give up on any of her worthy obsessions.	4	4
<i>Locke, Keith</i>	List		So far left he's sometimes out of sight but worked hard for a much higher profile this year.	3.5	3.5
<i>Norman, Russel</i>	List	Co-Leader	Isn't making the hits the Greens need to recover from poor poll ratings. Time is on his side but inspiration seems elusive. He must find it.	5	4
<i>Turei, Metiria</i>	List		An ordinary time since becoming co-leader and the jury is out on whether the Greens made the right choice. Emerging careerist.	5	4
Progressive					
<i>Anderton, Jim</i>	Wigram	Agriculture	Retirement beckons as his party dissolves into Labour. Spokesman on agriculture through weird coalition-in-opposition but his heart doesn't seem to be in it any more	5	3

Release: December 7, 2009.

